

MATHEMATICS 300 — SPRING 2015

Introduction to Mathematical Reasoning

H. J. Sussmann

INSTRUCTOR'S NOTES

BASED ON THE FEBRUARY 27 LECTURE BY PROF. LISA CARBONE

1 More on the natural numbers and induction

Recall that a natural number n is even if there exists $k \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $n = 2k$. Similarly n is odd if there exists $k \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $n = 2k - 1$.

Theorem 1. *Every natural number is either even or odd.*

Proof. Let $P(n)$ be the statement “ n is either even or odd”, for natural numbers n . We want to prove that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})P(n)$.

We will prove this by induction. For this purpose, we will prove that $P(1)$ and that $(\forall n)(P(n) \implies P(n+1))$.

Base case. $P(1)$ is true, because $P(1)$ says that “1 is even or odd”, and that is true because 1 is odd.

Inductive step. We prove that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})(P(n) \implies P(n+1))$.

Let n be an arbitrary natural number.

We want to prove that $P(n) \implies P(n+1)$. To prove this, we assume $P(n)$ and prove $P(n+1)$.

So assume that $P(n)$ is true. Then n is even or n is odd. To prove that $P(n+1)$ is true, we consider the cases when n is even and when n is odd. If n is even, then we may pick $k \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $n = 2k$. Then $n+1 = 2k+1 = 2(k+1) - 1$, and $k+1 \in \mathbb{N}$. So $n+1$ is odd. Hence $n+1$ is even or odd, so $P(n+1)$ is true. If n is odd, then we may pick $k \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $n = 2k - 1$, so $n+1 = 2k$, and then $n+1$ is even, so $n+1$ is even or odd, so $P(n+1)$ is true.

So we have proved that $P(n+1)$ is true in both cases, so $P(n+1)$ is true.

Since we have proved $P(n + 1)$ assuming $P(n)$, we have shown that $P(n) \implies P(n + 1)$. Since this has been established for arbitrary $n \in \mathbb{N}$, we have proved that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})(P(n) \implies P(n + 1))$. This concludes the inductive step.

Hence, by the PMI, $P(n)$ is true for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$. **Q.E.D.**

Theorem 2. *If n is a natural number and $n \neq 1$ then $n - 1$ is a natural number.*

Proof. For $n \in \mathbb{N}$, let $P(n)$ be the statement “ $n \neq 1 \implies n - 1 \in \mathbb{N}$ ”.

We want to prove that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})P(n)$.

We will prove this by induction. For this purpose, we will prove that $P(1)$ and that $(\forall n)(P(n) \implies P(n + 1))$.

Base case. $P(1)$ is true, because $P(1)$ says that “ $1 \neq 1 \implies 1 - 1 \in \mathbb{N}$ ” and this is true because it is an implication whose premiss (“ $1 \neq 1$ ”) is false.

Inductive step. We must show that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})(P(n) \implies P(n + 1))$.

Let $n \in \mathbb{N}$ be arbitrary. We want to prove that $P(n) \implies P(n + 1)$. To show this, we assume $P(n)$ and prove $P(n + 1)$.

So assume $P(n)$. That means that

$$(*) \quad n \neq 1 \implies n - 1 \in \mathbb{N}.$$

Then $P(n + 1)$ says

$$(\#) \quad n + 1 \neq 1 \implies (n + 1) - 1 \in \mathbb{N}.$$

But $(n + 1) - 1 = n$, and $n \in \mathbb{N}$, so the conclusion (“ $(n + 1) - 1 \in \mathbb{N}$ ”) of the implication $(\#)$ is true. Hence $(\#)$ is true. That is, $P(n + 1)$ is true. So we have proved $P(n + 1)$.

Since we have proved $P(n + 1)$ assuming $P(n)$, we have shown that $P(n) \implies P(n + 1)$. Since this has been established for arbitrary $n \in \mathbb{N}$, we have proved that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})(P(n) \implies P(n + 1))$. This concludes the inductive step.

Hence, by the PMI, $P(n)$ is true for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$. **Q.E.D.**

Theorem 3. *If $n \in \mathbb{N}$ then there is no natural number q such that $n < q < n + 1$.*

Proof. For $n \in \mathbb{N}$, let $P(n)$ be the statement “there is no natural number q such that $n < q < n + 1$ ”. We want to prove that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})P(n)$.

We will prove this by induction. For this purpose, we will prove that $P(1)$ and that $(\forall n)(P(n) \implies P(n + 1))$.

Base case. $P(1)$ is true, because $P(1)$ says that there are no natural numbers between 1 and 2, and this is true because of Theorem 2 of the previous lecture. (“Every natural number greater than 1 is greater than or equal to 2.”)

Inductive step. We must show that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})(P(n) \implies P(n+1))$.

Let $n \in \mathbb{N}$ be arbitrary. We want to prove that $P(n) \implies P(n+1)$. To show this, we assume $P(n)$ and prove $P(n+1)$.

So assume $P(n)$. That means that

(*) There does not exist a natural number q such that $n < q < n+1$.

We want to prove that $P(n+1)$ is true, i.e.,

(#) There does not exist a natural number q such that $n+1 < q < n+2$.

We prove this by contradiction. Suppose that a natural number q such that $n+1 < q < n+2$ exists. Pick one such number and call it q_0 . Then $q_0 \in \mathbb{N}$ and $n+1 < q_0 < n+2$. It then follows that $q_0 \neq 1$ (because $q_0 > n+1$ and $n+1 > 1$, so $q_0 > 1$).

So, by Theorem 2, $q_0 - 1$ is a natural number. And it is clear that $n < q_0 - 1 < n+1$. So there exists a natural number q such that $n < q < n+1$. But this contradicts (*).

So we have proved (#). Hence $P(n+1)$ is true.

Since we have proved $P(n+1)$ assuming $P(n)$, we have shown that $P(n) \implies P(n+1)$. Since this has been established for arbitrary $n \in \mathbb{N}$, we have proved that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})(P(n) \implies P(n+1))$. This concludes the inductive step.

Hence, by the PMI, $P(n)$ is true for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$.

Q.E.D.

1.1 Inductive definitions

We have defined “ x^2 ”, for a real number x , to mean “ $x.x$ ”. And we can define “ x^3 ” to mean “ $(x.x).x$ ”, or, if you prefer, “ $x^2.x$ ”. But how can we define “ x^n ” for an arbitrary natural number n ? One possibility would be to write something like this

$$x^n = \underbrace{x \times x \times \cdots \times x}_{n \text{ times}}$$

But this is very unclear. I do not know what “ \cdots ” means, precisely (and if you think you do, please tell me!). And, in any case, “ \cdots ” is not one of the

basic symbols that are all the symbols we are allowed to use. (That is, 0, 1, +, −, ×, ÷, =, <, ≤, ≥, >, (,), ∀, ∃, ∧, ∨, ⇒, ⇔, ∼, ∈, ℝ, ℕ, ℤ, plus letter variables, and symbols defined later, such as 2, 3, 4, |, and ⊆).

The way to define “ x^n ” correctly is by means of an inductive definition: we first define x^1 to be x , and then define x^{n+1} to be $x^n \cdot x$, for every n . That is, we write:

Definition 1. (*Inductive definition of positive integer powers of a real number*) For all $a \in \mathbb{R}$, we set

$$\begin{aligned} a^1 &= a, \\ a^{n+1} &= a^n \cdot a \quad \text{for } n \in \mathbb{N}. \end{aligned}$$

We also set $a^0 = 1$. □

Using this definition, we can write down what a^n is for any n .

Suppose, for example, that we want to know what a^5 is. By the second line of our inductive definition of a^n ,

$$a^5 = a^4 \cdot a.$$

This answers our question about a^5 , in terms of a^4 . And what is a^4 ? Again, using the second line of the inductive definition, we find

$$a^4 = a^3 \cdot a.$$

So

$$a^5 = ((a^3) \cdot a) \cdot a.$$

And what is a^3 ? Once again, we can use the second line of the inductive definition, and find

$$a^3 = a^2 \cdot a$$

So

$$a^5 = (((a^2) \cdot a) \cdot a) \cdot a.$$

One more step yields

$$a^2 = a^1 \cdot a,$$

so

$$a^5 = (((a^1 \cdot a) \cdot a) \cdot a) \cdot a.$$

And, finally, the first line of the inductive definition, tells us that $a^1 = a$, so we end up with

$$a^5 = (((a \cdot a) \cdot a) \cdot a) \cdot a.$$

Here are a few examples of inductive definitions:

Inductive definition of the factorial. The “factorial” of a natural number n is supposed to be the product $1 \times 2 \times 3 \times \cdots \times n$. That is, the factorial of n is the product of all the natural numbers from 1 to n . Here is the inductive definition:

Definition 2. The factorial of a natural number n is the number $n!$ given by

$$\begin{aligned} 1! &= 1, \\ (n+1)! &= n! \times (n+1) \quad \text{for } n \in \mathbb{N}. \end{aligned}$$

In addition, we define

$$0! = 1,$$

so $n!$ is defined for every nonnegative integer n .

Inductive definition of summation.

Definition 3. For a natural number n , and real numbers a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n , we define the sum (or summation) of the a_j for j from 1 to n to be the number $\sum_{j=1}^n a_j$ determined as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{j=1}^1 a_j &= a_1, \\ \sum_{j=1}^{n+1} a_j &= \left(\sum_{j=1}^n a_j \right) + a_{n+1} \quad \text{for } n \in \mathbb{N}. \end{aligned}$$

And we also define $\sum_{j=1}^0 a_j = 0$.

Inductive definition of product.

Definition 4. For a natural number n , and real numbers a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n , we define the product of the a_j for j from 1 to n to be the number $\prod_{j=1}^n a_j$ determined as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} \prod_{j=1}^1 a_j &= a_1, \\ \prod_{j=1}^{n+1} a_j &= \left(\prod_{j=1}^n a_j \right) \times a_{n+1} \quad \text{for } n \in \mathbb{N}. \end{aligned}$$

And we also define $\prod_{j=1}^0 a_j = 1$.

1.1.1 Some examples of proofs using inductive definitions

Theorem 4. For all $n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$\sum_{k=1}^n (2k - 1) = n^2.$$

(That is, the sum of the first n odd numbers is a perfect square, namely, n^2 .)

Proof. For $n \in \mathbb{N}$, let $P(n)$ be the statement “ $\sum_{k=1}^n (2k - 1) = n^2$ ”. We want to prove that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})P(n)$.

We will prove this by induction. For this purpose, we will prove that $P(1)$ and that $(\forall n)(P(n) \implies P(n + 1))$.

Base case. $P(1)$ is true, because $P(1)$ says that $\sum_{k=1}^1 (2k - 1) = 1^2$, which is true because $\sum_{k=1}^1 (2k - 1) = 1$ and $1^2 = 1$.

Inductive step. We prove that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})(P(n) \implies P(n + 1))$.

Let n be an arbitrary natural number. We want to prove that $P(n) \implies P(n + 1)$. To prove this, we assume $P(n)$ and prove $P(n + 1)$.

So assume that $P(n)$ is true. Then

$$\sum_{k=1}^n (2k - 1) = n^2.$$

We want to prove that $P(n + 1)$ is true, i.e., that

$$(1.1) \quad \sum_{k=1}^{n+1} (2k - 1) = (n + 1)^2.$$

But, by the inductive definition of “summation”,

$$\sum_{k=1}^{n+1} (2k - 1) = \sum_{k=1}^n (2k - 1) + (2(n + 1) - 1).$$

And our inductive assumption tells us that

$$\sum_{k=1}^n (2k - 1) = n^2.$$

So

$$\begin{aligned}
 \sum_{k=1}^{n+1} (2k-1) &= \sum_{k=1}^n (2k-1) + (2(n+1)-1) \\
 &= n^2 + (2(n+1)-1) \\
 &= n^2 + (2n+2-1) \\
 &= n^2 + 2n+1 \\
 &= (n+1)^2.
 \end{aligned}$$

Hence (1.1) is true. So we have proved that $P(n+1)$ is true, assuming $P(n)$.

Since we have proved $P(n+1)$ assuming $P(n)$, we have shown that $P(n) \implies P(n+1)$. Since this has been established for arbitrary $n \in \mathbb{N}$, we have proved that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})(P(n) \implies P(n+1))$. This concludes the inductive step.

Hence, by the PMI, $P(n)$ is true for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$.

Q.E.D.

Theorem 5. For all $n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$\sum_{k=1}^n k^2 = \frac{n^3}{3} + \frac{n^2}{2} + \frac{n}{6}.$$

Proof. For $n \in \mathbb{N}$, let $P(n)$ be the statement " $\sum_{k=1}^n k^2 = \frac{n^3}{3} + \frac{n^2}{2} + \frac{n}{6}$ ". We want to prove that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})P(n)$.

We will prove this by induction. For this purpose, we will prove that $P(1)$ and that $(\forall n)(P(n) \implies P(n+1))$.

Base case. $P(1)$ is true, because $P(1)$ says that

$$\sum_{k=1}^1 k^2 = \frac{1}{3} + \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{6},$$

and this is true because $\sum_{k=1}^1 k^2 = 1$ and $\frac{1}{3} + \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{6} = 1$.

Inductive step. We prove that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})(P(n) \implies P(n+1))$.

Let n be an arbitrary natural number. We want to prove that $P(n) \implies P(n+1)$. To prove this, we assume $P(n)$ and prove $P(n+1)$.

So assume that $P(n)$ is true. Then

$$\sum_{k=1}^n k^2 = \frac{n^3}{3} + \frac{n^2}{2} + \frac{n}{6}.$$

We want to prove that $P(n+1)$ is true, i.e., that

$$(1.2) \quad \sum_{k=1}^{n+1} k^2 = \frac{(n+1)^3}{3} + \frac{(n+1)^2}{2} + \frac{n+1}{6}.$$

But, by the inductive definition of “summation”,

$$\sum_{k=1}^{n+1} k^2 = \sum_{k=1}^n k^2 + (n+1)^2.$$

And our inductive assumption tells us that

$$\sum_{k=1}^n k^2 = \frac{n^3}{3} + \frac{n^2}{2} + \frac{n}{6}.$$

So

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{k=1}^{n+1} k^2 &= \left(\sum_{k=1}^n k^2 \right) + (n+1)^2 \\ &= \frac{n^3}{3} + \frac{n^2}{2} + \frac{n}{6} + (n+1)^2. \end{aligned}$$

Now we have to prove that

$$(1.3) \quad \frac{n^3}{3} + \frac{n^2}{2} + \frac{n}{6} + (n+1)^2 = \frac{(n+1)^3}{3} + \frac{(n+1)^2}{2} + \frac{n+1}{6}.$$

But

$$(n+1)^2 = n^2 + 2n + 1,$$

so

$$\frac{n^3}{3} + \frac{n^2}{2} + \frac{n}{6} + (n+1)^2 = \frac{n^3}{3} + \frac{3n^2}{2} + \frac{13n}{6} + 1,$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{(n+1)^3}{3} + \frac{(n+1)^2}{2} + \frac{n+1}{6} &= \frac{n^3 + 3n^2 + 3n + 1}{3} + \frac{n^2 + 2n + 1}{2} + \frac{n+1}{6} \\ &= \frac{n^3}{3} + n^2 + n + \frac{1}{3} + \frac{n^2}{2} + n + \frac{1}{2} + \frac{n}{6} + \frac{1}{6} \\ &= \frac{n^3}{3} + \frac{3n^2}{2} + \frac{13n}{6} + 1. \end{aligned}$$

So both sides of (1.3) are equal to $\frac{n^3}{3} + \frac{3n^2}{2} + \frac{13n}{6} + 1$. Hence (1.3) is true, and therefore (1.2) is true. Sp $P(n+1)$ is true. So we have proved that $P(n+1)$ is true, assuming $P(n)$.

Since we have proved $P(n+1)$ assuming $P(n)$, we have shown that $P(n) \implies P(n+1)$. Since this has been established for arbitrary $n \in \mathbb{N}$, we have proved that $(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})(P(n) \implies P(n+1))$. This concludes the inductive step.

Hence, by the PMI, $P(n)$ is true for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$.

Q.E.D.